# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

v.

Civil Action No. 06-409-GMS

M.A. HANNA PLASTICS GROUP, INC., WILMINGTON ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION AND SIDNEY AND CAROL MAFFETT

Defendants.

#### STIPULATION AND JOINT MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

Plaintiff, United States of America, on behalf of the United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), and Defendant Wilmington Economic Development Corporation ("Defendant") have hereby stipulated that discovery in this case will involve the production of documents which have been submitted to EPA by various contractors (listed in Annex 1) (hereinafter "submitter(s)") containing information which may be entitled to confidential treatment. In view of this stipulation, the Court finds that good cause exists for issuance of an order limiting disclosure of such information. Upon consideration of the joint motion for such an order filed by the parties hereto and pursuant to Rule 26(c), Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, It is Hereby Ordered:

- 1. Plaintiff shall produce the document(s) containing information which may be entitled to confidential treatment to the Defendant and such document(s) shall be handled in accordance with the terms of this Stipulation and Protective Order ("Protective Order").
- 2. As used in this Protective Order, the term "confidential business information" means trade secrets or commercial or financial information submitted by a person (as defined in

40 CFR Part 2, Subpart B) to Plaintiff and which may be entitled to confidential treatment under 40 CFR Part 2. This information has not been determined by Plaintiff under 40 CFR Part 2, Subpart B not to be entitled to confidential treatment.

- 3. Any information to be produced by Plaintiff pursuant to this Protective Order shall be stamped conspicuously with the words "CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION" by the Plaintiff on the bottom of each page of each document prior to production to the Defendant. The transmittal of information designated as confidential business information shall be done by letter from the Plaintiff stating that the information designated as confidential business information is subject to this Protective Order.
- 4. Information designated as confidential business information under this Protective Order shall not be used or disclosed by the Defendant or any other person, subject to Paragraph 7 below, for any purpose other than the preparation for, and trial of, this action and any appeal thereof.
- 5. The Defendant and Defendant's counsel who obtain information designated as confidential business information hereunder, and any nonparty subject to this Protective Order, shall not disclose or permit disclosure of this confidential business information to any other person, including without limitation any officer, director, employee, agent, or representative of Defendant, Defendant's counsel, or any nonparty, except in the following circumstances:
- Disclosure may be made to employees, including officers and directors, of a. Defendant or of Defendant's counsel who have responsibility for the preparation and trial of this action or any appeal thereof. Any employee to whom disclosure is made shall be advised of, and become subject to, the provisions of this Protective Order prior to such disclosure by executing the Confidentiality Agreement annexed hereto (Annex 2). Employees do not include person,

Page 3 of 11

firms or corporations engaged by Defendant or Defendant's counsel on a contract basis, who shall be subject to the requirements of subparagraph (b) of this Paragraph.

- b. Disclosure may be made to consultants, witnesses, experts, or employees or experts ("Expert(s)") employed or otherwise engaged by any party or counsel to any party to assist in the preparation and trial of this litigation. Prior to disclosure to any Expert, the Expert must agree to be bound by the terms of this Protective Order by executing the Confidentiality Agreement attached hereto (Annex. 2). A copy of each executed Confidentiality Agreement shall be furnished to the Plaintiff and submitted not less than five (5) business days prior to disclosure to the Expert.
- 6. Defendant, Defendant's counsel, and any other person subject to this Protective Order who obtains information designated as confidential business information hereunder, shall take all necessary and appropriate measures to maintain the confidentiality of the information, shall share such information only with persons authorized to receive it pursuant to this Protective Order, and shall retain the information in a secure manner. Except as provided in Paragraph 5 above, no other person shall be permitted access to the information.
- 7. Any person who obtains access to information designated as confidential business information under this Protective Order may make copies, duplicates, extracts, summaries, or descriptions of the information or any portion thereof only for the purpose of preparation for litigation in this matter. All copies, duplicates, extracts, etc. shall be subject to the terms of this Protective Order to the same extent and manner as original documents.
- 8. Any information designated as confidential business information under this

  Protective Order, which a party wishes to file with the Court, shall be filed with the Court in

  sealed envelopes or other appropriate sealed containers on which shall be endorsed the caption of

this litigation, as indication of the nature of the contents of such sealed envelope or container, the words "CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORMATION", and a statement substantially in the following form:

"This envelope, containing documents which are filed in this case by XXXXXX ("the producing party") is not to be opened and the contents are not to be displayed or revealed except by order of the Court or the consent of EPA."

In addition, if such documents have been sealed and filed with the Court, the submitter shall be informed of this by the filing party at the time of filing.

- 9. Any authorized disclosure of information designated as confidential business information under this Protective Order shall not result in a waiver of any submitter's claim of confidentiality.
- 10. If Plaintiff desires to add contractors to the list in Annex 1, Plaintiff may file written notice with the Court and the Defendants of the identities of such contractors. If the Defendants do not object within three days of receipt of such notice, the contractors will be added to Annex 1.
- Within 60 days after termination of this action by judgment, settlement or 11. otherwise, or as may be determined by the Court or EPA:
- Any person who obtained information designated as confidential business a. information hereunder shall assemble and return such information to Plaintiff, including all copies, duplicates, extracts, summaries, or descriptions of the information or portions thereof. Such return shall be certified in writing by the person who obtained the information from EPA. All such information covered by this Protective Order which constitutes the work product of counsel for the Defendants shall be destroyed; and,

b. The Clerk of the Court shall maintain under seal all papers filed under seal until the Court orders otherwise.

Dated: August <u>9</u>, 2007

Robert W. Whetzel (#2288)
Todd A. Coomes (#4694)
RICHARDS, LAYTON & FINGER PA
One Rodney Square
920 North King Street
Wilmington, Delaware 19801
(302) 651-7700
whetzel@rlf.com
coomes@rlf.com
Attorneys for Defendant Wilmington
Economic Development Corporation

Page 6 of 11

# ANNEX 1

# LIST OF CONTRACTORS

# 12th Street Landfill, DE Site ID D330

#### Contract No. 68-S3-9904

Emergency and Rapid Response Service (ERRS2) Guardian Environmental Services 1280 Porter Road Bear, DE 19701

Phone: (302) 834-1000

# Contract No. 68-W4-0010

**Enforcement Support Services** Booz, Allen and Hamilton, Inc. Corporate Office - Bldg. HMLT-9026 8283 Greensboro Drive McLean, VA 22102 Phone: (703) 902-5009

#### Contract No. 68-D6-0002

**Environmental Services Assistance Teams** (ESAT) Lockheed Environmental Engineering 2339 Rt. 70 West, 4th Floor Cherry Hill, NJ 08002-2315 Phone: (856) 486-5176

#### Contract No. 68-W0-1018

**Environmental Services Assistance Teams** (ESAT) Lockheed Martin Services, Inc. 2339 Rt. 70 West, 4th Floor Cherry Hill, NJ 08002-2315 Phone: (856) 486-5176

#### Contract No. 68-W9-9022

Contract Lab Program Envirosystems, Inc. 9200 Rumsey Road Suite B102 Columbia, MD 21045-1934

Phone: (410) 964-0303

#### Contract No. 68-S3-0002

Superfund Technical Assessment and Response Team (START) Tetra Tech EM Inc. 1800 John F. Kennedy Blvd., 6th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 Phone: (215) 972-0444

#### Contract No. 68-S5-3002

Superfund Technical Assessment and Response Team (START) Roy F. Weston, Inc. 1400 Weston Way P.O Box 3653 West Chester, PA 19380 Phone: (610) 701-4698

#### Contract No. 68-D5-0011

Contract Lab Program American Environmental Network Severn Trent Laboratories- NJ P.O Box 7777 Philadelphia, PA 19175-4925 Phone: (215) 428-8181

#### Contract no. 68-D5-0137

Contract Lab Program Southwest Lab of Oklahoma 1700 West Albany Broken Arrow, OK 74012-1421 Phone: (918) 251-2858

#### Contract No. 68-W0-1034

Contract Lab Program Dyncorp Information 15000 Conference Center Drive Chantilly, VA 20151 Phone: (703) 818-4197

#### Contract No. 68-W0-0087

Contract lab Program
Data Chem Laboratories
960 West Levoy Drive
Salt Lake City, UT 84123
Phone: (801) 266-7700

#### Contract No. 68-W9-9076

Contract lab Program Mitchem Corp. 175 Metro Center Boulevard Warwick, RI 02886-175 Phone: (401) 732-3400

#### Contract No. 68-W0-0082

Contract Lab Program Liberty Analytical Corp. 501 Madison Avenue Cary, NC 27513 Phone: (919) 379-4004

#### Contract No. 68-W9-9069

Contract Lab Program Clayton Environmental Consultants 22345 Roethel Drive Novi, MI 48375 Phone: (248) 344-1770

#### Contract No. 68-D4-0104

Contract Lab Program
Dyncorp - Class Contract
15000 Conference Center Drive
Chantilly, VA 20151
Phone: (703) 818-4197

NUS Corporation 3475 East Foothill Blvd. Pasadena, CA 91107-2101 Phone: (626) 351-4664

# Annex 2

# Stipulation and Protective Order Confidentiality Agreement

The undersigned is currently working at	which is located at
During the past year th	e undersigned has been employed or otherwise
engaged as a consultant or contractor by the follo	owing company located at the following address:
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	·
The undersigned herby acknowledges that	at he/she has read the foregoing Stipulation and
Protective Order ("Protective Order") executed by	by the attorneys of record for the parties in the
action presently pending in the U.S. District Cou	art for the District of Delaware, entitled United
States v. M.A. Hanna Plastics Groups, Inc. et al.,	, understands the terms thereof, and agrees, upon
threat of penalty of contempt, to be bound by suc	ch terms. The undersigned understands that
disclosure of information which has been design	ated as confidential business information by the
submitter of that information may cause substant	tial harm to the affected business' competitive
position. Accordingly, among other responsibili	ties, the undersigned shall only share such
information with person specifically authorized t	to receive the information pursuant to the
Protective Order, shall retain the information in a	a secure manner, and shall use such information
only for the purposes authorized by the Protectiv	e Order. The undersigned understands that the
pledge of confidentiality under this Agreement c	ontinues after the lawsuit is over. Furthermore,
the undersigned understands that a breach of the	Protective Order may subject him/her to civil
claims for damages and to criminal prosecution u	ander 42 U.S.C. 9604(e)(7)(B).
Dated:	
Signed:	

# For: UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Dated: August 3, 2007

Dated: August 13, 2007

COLM F. CONNOLLY United States Attorney

Patricia C. Hannigan

Assistant United States Attorney

Delaware Bar I.D. No. 2145

The Nemours Building

1007 Orange Street, Suite 700

P.O Box 2046

Wilmington, DE 19899-2046

(302) 573-6277

Andrew Goldman

Sr. Assistant Regional Counsel

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1650 Arch Street

Philadelphia, PA 19103

IT IS SO ORDERED this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_, 2007:

HONORABLE GREGORY M. SLEET United States District Judge

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Patricia C. Hannigan, hereby certify that on August 13, 2007, I electronically filed the foregoing STIPULATION AND JOINT MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER with the Clerk of Court using CM/ECF which will send electronic notification of such filing to the following:

# Robert W. Whetzel, Esquire

Richards, Layton & Finger One Rodney Square 920 North King Street Wilmington, DE 19801 (302) 651-7634 (302) 651-7701 (FAX) whetzel@rlf.com gibson@rlf.com

#### Michael W. Arrington, Esquire

Filed 08/13/2007

Parkowski, Guerke & Swayze 800 King Street, Suite 203 Wilmington, DE 19801 (302) 594-3333 (302) 654-3033 (FAX) marrington@pgslegal.com

## Kenneth E. Aaron, Esquire

Weir & Partners, LLP The Widener Building 1339 Chestnut St, Suite 500 Philadelphia, PA 19107 215-665-8181 Kaaron@weirpartners.com

### **Todd Anthony Coomes, Esquire**

Richards, Layton & Finger One Rodney Square P.O. Box 551 Wilmington, DE 19899 (302) 651-7507 Fax: (302) 498-7507 coomes@rlf.com

Notice has been delivered by other means to:

# John M. Scagnelli, Esquire

Scarinci & Hollenbeck, LLC 1100 Valley Brook Avenue Lyndhurst, NJ 07071-0790 (201) 896-4100 (201) 896-8660 (FAX) iscagnelli@nilegalink.com via First Class U.S. Mail

# Kathleen J. Devlin, Esquire

Scarinci & Hallenbeck LLC 1100 Valley Brook Avenue P.O. Box 790 Lyndhurst, NJ 07071-0790 201-896-4100 201-896-8660 (FAX) kdevlin@njlegalink.com via First Class U.S. Mail

COLM F. CONNOLLY United States Attorney

By: /s/Patricia C. Hannigan

Patricia C. Hannigan
Assistant United States Attorney
Delaware Bar I.D. No. 2145
The Nemours Building
1007 Orange Street, Suite 700
P. O. Box 2046
Wilmington, DE 19899-2046
(302) 573-6277
Patricia.Hannigan@usdoj.gov